# Towards a comprehensive understanding of free-living nitrogen fixation

Sehroon Khan<sup>1,2\*</sup>, Sadia Nadir<sup>3</sup>, Shahid Iqbal<sup>2</sup>, Jianchu Xu<sup>2,4</sup>, Heng Gui<sup>2</sup>, Afsar Khan<sup>5</sup>, and Lei Ye<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Department of Biotechnology, Faculty of Natural Sciences, University of Science and Technology, Bannu 28100, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan

<sup>2</sup> Honghe Centre for Mountain Futures, Kunming Institute of Botany, Chinese Academy of Sciences, Honghe 654400, Yunnan, China

<sup>3</sup> Department of Chemistry, Faculty of Natural Sciences, University of Science and Technology, Bannu 28100, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan

<sup>4</sup> CIFOR-ICRAF China Country Program, World Agroforestry Centre, Kunming 650201, China

<sup>5</sup> Department of Chemistry, COMSATS University Islamabad (Abbottabad Campus)-22060, Pakistan

\* Corresponding author, E-mail: sehroon@ustb.edu.pk, sehroon@mail.kib.ac.cn

### Abstract

Free-living nitrogen fixation (FNF) is a ubiquitous phenomenon that plays a modest role in the (N) economy of an ecosystem. However, sampling difficulties, methodological constraints and environmental controls have presented challenges for predicting the actual rate of FNF. Therefore, a deeper understanding of the accuracy to design models that consider dynamics, heterogeneity, influences, and other limitations is needed. This review presents an overview of the biology and diversity of microorganisms related to FNF as well as various ecological controls that influence these microorganisms. We also discussed contributions of FNF to the N input of various ecosystems. Overall, previous research has shown that considerable spatiotemporal variability exists in microbial types at both biome and microbiome scales, resulting in significant variation in FNF. Beyond this, rate of FNF is controlled by certain factors, such oxygen and metal ion availability, source of energy and soil nutrients, temperature, and pH. Empirical evidence increasingly indicates a significant contribution of FNF to N inputs in natural, agricultural, and aquatic ecosystems. It is inferred from this review that for the expanded exploitation of biological nitrogen fixation (BNF), we must pay additional attention to FNF because it occupies a central role within the process. Finally, we propose a framework for the quantification of FNF alongside a suite of recommendations that would deepen our understanding of FNF.

**Citation:** Khan S, Nadir S, Iqbal, Xu J, Gui H, et al. 2021. Towards a comprehensive understanding of free-living nitrogen fixation. *Circular Agricultural Systems* 1: 13 https://doi.org/10.48130/CAS-2021-0013

# Introduction

Biological nitrogen fixation (BNF) contributes to 50% of the total annual usable nitrogen (N) of the biosphere<sup>[1–3]</sup>. The N molecule itself is highly inert; however, its fixation can generate compounds that contain reactive N (Nr), including NH<sub>3</sub>, NO, NO<sub>2</sub>, N<sub>2</sub>O, HNO<sub>3</sub>, and other organic N compounds<sup>[4]</sup>. Though N is abundantly present in the atmosphere, it is the most critical and limiting factor for ecosystem productivity<sup>[5,6]</sup>, which is supported by BNF.

A group of bacteria and archaea named diazotrophs carry out BNF. A high percentage of total BNF is carried out via symbiotic N fixation in which the host plant provides photosynthetically fixed carbon to the symbiotic diazotrophs for their growth, while the host plant obtains the biologically fixed N<sup>[7]</sup>. Moreover, under specific conditions, non-symbiotic, free-living diazotrophs such as *Burkholderia*, *Azotobacter*, *Klebsiella*, *Azospirillum*, *Bacillus*, and *Clostridium* can also fix substantial amounts of N, which is known as free-living nitrogen fixation (FNF)<sup>[8,9]</sup>. In some cases, diazotrophs establish weak associations with lichens and cycads, including *Ceratozamia Mexicana* and some higher plants (e.g., conifers, cereals, and sugarcane), or colonize plant tissues and perform N fixation, which is considered associative N fixation<sup>[10,11]</sup>. Thus, FNF specifically is a form of BNF in which no obvious structures or symbiosis are established between plants and microbes. So far, there is no exact delineation between these forms of BNF<sup>[12]</sup>. In light of aforesaid definition, free-living N fixers include soil-dwelling associative bacteria (such as *Cyanobacteria, Azotobacter, Klebsiella,* and *Pseudomonas*); hetero-trophic bacteria (such as *Xanthomonas* sp. and *Phyllobacterium* sp.<sup>[13]</sup>; anaerobic bacteria that inhabit reduced soil layers<sup>[9,14]</sup>; endophytic bacteria (such as *Herbaspirillum* sp., *Azoarcus* sp., and *Gluconacetobacter diazotrophicus*) that resides inside plant tissues; lichens (such as *Lobaria pulmonaria* and *L. quercizans*<sup>[15,16]</sup>; and species of archaeal domain (such as *Methanosarcina barker* and *Methanococcus thermolithotrophicus*<sup>[17]</sup>).

Recognizing the fact that free-living N fixers are growing, they require a large amount of carbon (C) and energy compounds to carry out their cellular processes<sup>[18,19]</sup>. Additionally, in symbiotic N-fixing bacteria, N fixation mainly occurs in non-growing cells, while in free-living N-fixers, fixation only occurs in growing cells. The N fixation rate of free-living fixers is consequently lower than symbiotic fixers that fix N in a static mode, returning the source of C<sup>[7]</sup>. Moreover, the lifetime of a free-living N fixing diazotroph is much shorter than a nodule that carries out N fixation activity for up to one month<sup>[19]</sup>. Although FNF is ubiquitous, research on FNF is largely lacking. Compared to symbiotic N fixation, FNF can potentially

contribute to much higher levels of N in an ecosystem<sup>[12]</sup>. For example, studies on tropical forest systems identified that FNF occurring in the rhizosphere, litter, and on the decaying surfaces of logs, leaves, and plants contributed 6 kg N ha<sup>-1</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup> while 4.5 kg N ha<sup>-1</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup> via symbiotic N fixation<sup>[20]</sup>.

Our review focuses on FNF, which is a global phenomenon of N addition to ecosystems. However, N inputs by FNF is difficult to estimate due to profound spatial and temporal variability in FNF<sup>[7]</sup>. We compiled and integrated information related to the biology and diversity of FNF organisms as well as factors that influence FNF. In addition, we discussed: 1) the contribution of FNF to the N budget of different ecosystems; 2) quantification of FNF using different methods; and 3) anthropogenic activities that affect FNF. It is hoped that our discussion deepens understanding of FNF functions across various ecosystems.

# Biology and diversity of free-living N fixing organisms

Around 90 genera of diazotrophs possess the ability to fix atmospheric N<sup>[21]</sup>. Diazotrophs exhibit the following range of physiologies: they are strictly aerobic (such as Cyanobacteria and Azotobacter); facultatively anaerobic (such as Bacillus, Carnobacterium, Paenibacillus, Pseudomonas, gamma-proteobacteria, and Actinobacteria) or anaerobic (such as Clostridium); heterotrophic (such as Rhodobacter and Anabaena); phototrophic (such as Rhodobacter capsulatus); and chemolithotrophic (such as Leptospirillum ferrooxidans). Cyanobacteria (such as Cyanothece sp. and Synechococcus sp.) is prevalent in terrestrial ecosystems because of its ability to colonize matter in extreme environments like deserts and tundra<sup>[10,22]</sup>. Cyanobacteria can also grow on tree trunks in temperate or tropical forests as well as on moss carpets where they decompose litter and marine environments (e.g., Crocosphaera watsonii)<sup>[23]</sup>. Moreover, active N fixation by heterotrophic bacteria, such as Clostridium butyricum, Enterobacter agglomerons, and Klebsiella pneumoniae, has been reported in different habitats that even include Antarctica<sup>[24]</sup>. Lichens have also been reported to fix N in many ecosystems<sup>[25]</sup>. Data from Hawaiian forests reveal that the canopy features a higher rate of N fixation over the forest mainly because of lichen abundance in these locations<sup>[26,27]</sup>. Within the Archaea, N fixation has been found only in the methanogens. For example, Methanococcus thermolithotrophicus, a thermophilic lithotrophic methanogen, can fix N at 60 °C<sup>[17]</sup>. As free-living N-fixers have diverse natures, habitat, and distributions, considerable spatio-temporal variability exists at both biome and microbiome scales, which in turn results in significant variation in the overall rate of N fixation<sup>[27]</sup>.

# Nitrogen fixation enzymes

Two groups of nitrogenase in soil catalyze N fixation<sup>[28]</sup>. The first group consists of molybdenum (Mo) nitrogenase; vanadium (V) nitrogenase; and an iron (Fe) nitrogenase<sup>[29,30]</sup>, which are oxygen sensitive and differ in kinetic parameters<sup>[29]</sup>. The second group contains a less-studied nitrogenase of the bacteria, *Streptomyces Thermoautotrophicus*, which is

structurally very different from group 1 nitrogenases<sup>[31]</sup>. This enzyme is not sensitive to O<sub>2</sub> and other known nitrogenase inhibitors<sup>[32]</sup>. X-ray studies have revealed that nitrogenase of the first group share a similar structure<sup>[13,33]</sup>. In general, nitrogenase is composed of two major components<sup>[34-36]</sup>. Component one is termed 'MoFe protein', which possesses unique subunits and cofactors. In MoFe protein, subunits  $\alpha$ and  $\beta$  are combined as  $\alpha$ - $\beta$ . Between  $\alpha$ - $\beta$ , a prosthetic group termed the P-cluster is present (8Fe:7S P)<sup>[37,38]</sup>. The 7Fe: M: 9S: C: homocitrate cofactor (also known as M center) contains the centrally located Fe atoms that constitute the substrate binding site of the nitrogenase enzyme<sup>[39,40]</sup>. In addition, the small subunit, designated  $\delta_i$  is also present that stabilizes two tetramers<sup>[39]</sup>. The Fe protein is the second component of nitrogenase, with two subunits that are bridged by a 4Fe:4S cluster<sup>[40]</sup>. Each subunit of Fe protein has its own ATP binding site that reduces MoFe protein<sup>[41]</sup>.

Mo-dependent nitrogenase is the predominant nitrogenase present in almost all free-living N fixing bacteria<sup>[28,42]</sup>. The predominate form of nitrogenases in archaea is Monitrogenase, consisting of the same subunits as bacteria, excluding nitrogenase reductase, which in archaea is a homotetramer, unlike the homodimer found in bacteria<sup>[17]</sup>. Only in *A. vinelandii* are all three types of nitrogenase of the first group present<sup>[43,5]</sup>. However, it has also been demonstrated that Monitrogenase shows high efficiency at high temperatures, while alternative nitrogenases are more efficient at lower temperatures<sup>[18,44]</sup>.

# Nitrogen fixation genes and their regulation

The N fixation gene, i.e., nif that encode for the nitrogenase, are an evolutionarily conserved set of genes in N fixing microorganisms. The nif genes have many subunits that encode for proteins, forming the structural subunits of the nitrogenase enzyme, the cofactors, and other regulatory proteins involved in N fixation. The three nif genes, nifH, nifD, and nifK, are highly conserved structural genes, and are grouped together in one operon in almost all N fixing microorganisms, barring some rhizobia species. The gene nifH encrypts for Fe-protein, and the nifD and nifK encode for Fe-Mo proteins (dinitrogenase), respectively<sup>[45]</sup>. The *nifLA* operon consists of nifA and nifL genes that regulate the expression of other nif genes. Various factors tightly regulate the transcription of nif genes, including levels of fixed N, carbon, ATP/ADP ratio, and oxygen concentration<sup>[45,46]</sup>. The nifA gene encodes for a binding protein. The RNA polymerase sigma factor  $\sigma^5$  is activated under N limiting conditions and activates the expression of other nif genes<sup>[47]</sup>. Moreover, NtrB-NtrC regulatory systems usually regulates nifA transcription<sup>[48,45]</sup>. nifL gene-encoding for the flavoprotein is activated under N excess and high redox status, inhibiting the expression of nifA and other nif genes. Another locus is called nifx, which is also supposed to work in a similar way to *nifL* genes in inhibiting nif expression<sup>[49]</sup>. Regulation of N fixation by nifL-nifA systems varies from organism to organism<sup>[45]</sup>. In Kallesbela pneumoniae, the N sensor protein glnB regulates NtrB-NtrC systems, which then control the expression of glnK, nifL, and nifA proteins<sup>[46,50]</sup>. Under N-limiting conditions, *qlnK* is essential to stop nifL from hindering nifA. Conversely, in A. vinelandii, alnK is not required for *nifL* to inhibit *nifA* under conditions of N limitations<sup>[51–54]</sup>. For diazotrophs such as *Azospirillum brasilense* and *Rhodospirillum rubrum*, post-translational regulation of nitrogenase has been demonstrated<sup>[55–57]</sup>. In the presence of external sources of N such as ammonium, a regulatory protein, dinitrogenase reductase glycohydrolase (DraG), is activated, switching off nitrogenase enzymes. In N-limiting conditions, dinitrogenase reductase ADP-ribosyltransferase (DraT) activates nitrogenase activity. However, our knowledge about the detailed regulation mechanism of DraG-Drat remains limited<sup>[57]</sup>.

The structural organization of nif genes also varies extensively within genomes of different N fixing organisms. In K. pneumoniae, 20 nif genes are organized into 9 transcriptional units that cluster together on the chromosome<sup>[58]</sup>. Similar nif gene organization is found in Azotobacter, Asospirillum, and Clostridium<sup>[40]</sup>. In cyanobacterium, Anabaena sp, strain PCC 7120, 14 nif genes have been recognized<sup>[59]</sup>. The nif genes in Anabena sp. are not organized into clusters or groups, but rather have been dispersed due to the insertion of intervening DNA elements<sup>[59,60]</sup>. The classification of the methanogen nif gene discloses some transformations when compared to bacteria<sup>[17]</sup>. In methanogens, novel homologues of the bacterial N sensor regulator glnB are located between nifH and nifD genes. Moreover, six nif genes (nifH, nifD, nifK, nifE, nifN, and nifX) and the glnB in a single operon are unique to methanogens<sup>[17]</sup>.

# Estimates of N fixation: An assumption or bias?

Various studies have reported that symbiotic N fixation is a dominant source of N to the ecosystem<sup>[21,61]</sup> which can supply 150 kg N ha<sup>-1</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup> to an ecosystem. However, N supply by FNF may be as high as  $\sim$ 76 Tg N yr<sup>-1</sup>, exceeding the overall supply by lightning (5 Tg N yr<sup>-1</sup>) and industry-fixed N (120 Tg N yr<sup>-1</sup>)<sup>[12]</sup>. It has been shown that FNF contributes to a significant amount of N in ecosystems in the absence of symbionts<sup>[22]</sup>. For example, biological soil crusts with a variety of microbial communities may fix significant quantities of N in dryland ecosystems with scarce symbiotic N fixation<sup>[62-65]</sup>. FNF is the major source of N in temperate and boreal forests where abundant cyanobacteria are present in ground moss covering<sup>[66]</sup>. FNF provides major support to plant production in wetland ecosystems in Brazil where symbiotic N fixation is rare<sup>[8,67,68]</sup>. Additionally, FNF is the dominant source of N availability in temperate forests, temperate grasslands, and shrub lands, and has also been found to occur in deep soils, canopy soils, and canopy leaves<sup>[9,12,69–71]</sup>. FNF may be high at sites where N demand is high and vice versa. As FNF occurs under diverse and variable environmental conditions across a variety of substrates, predicting actual rates of FNF can be challenging. Studies attempting to estimate the rates of N fixation by symbiotic and free-living pathways are not from simultaneous assessments and are typically not from the same individual sites<sup>[12]</sup>. In fact, methodological constraints as well as significant spatial and temporal variations found in the process preclude us from developing conclusive estimates, potentially leading to an underestimation of global rates of FNF.

# Ecological controls over free-living N fixing organisms

### Oxygen (O<sub>2</sub>) sensitivity

A major factor that limits FNF is the O<sub>2</sub> liability of nitrogenase enzymes<sup>[29,30,72]</sup>. As a mechanism to protect nitrogenase from O2, most obligate and facultative aerobes tend to increase their cellular respiration rate, which tends to lower O2 levels. Further, N-fixers have developed other mechanisms to avoid O<sub>2</sub> toxicity by carrying out fixation in separate cellular compartments that spatially separate N fixation from photosynthesis<sup>[73,74]</sup> or a conformational change in nitrogenase, though this also affects fixation<sup>[75]</sup>. The O<sub>2</sub> liability of nitrogenase confines N fixation to anaerobic or microaerobic environments, with the exception of A. vinelandii, which can fix N<sub>2</sub> under entirely aerated conditions<sup>[76]</sup>. In anaerobic environments, rates of N fixation remain relatively high because there is no need to protect nitrogenase against  $O_{2}$ , and the energetic cost of fixation is relatively low. However, the capacity to fix N by anaerobic and microaerophilic bacteria is constrained by the inefficiency of anaerobic metabolism. Indeed, O<sub>2</sub> concentrations in environments are constant and thus hard to quantify<sup>[46,72,75]</sup>. An optimal  $O_2$ requirement cannot be defined for a mixed microbial community, where each diazotroph has a different O<sub>2</sub> requirement.

#### **Metal ions**

Molybdenum (Mo) is central for the activity of nitrogenase enzyme; however, in some species it is replaced by a vanadium (V) or iron (Fe)<sup>[77–80]</sup>. In terrestrial ecosystems, where Mo is often limited in soil, a significant fraction of FNF is carried out by either vanadium nitrogenases or iron nitrogenases<sup>[15,81–83]</sup>. Bacteria also require other metals like K, Ca, and Mg to fix N. Deficiency of these metals affects the N-fixing efficiency of some FNF bacteria, as these act as cofactors in reactions<sup>[84]</sup>.

#### **Energy requirement**

FNF require a continuous input of reducing source and ATP supply<sup>[85,86]</sup>. Generally, 16 molecules of ATP are needed to fix one molecule of  $N_2^{[87]}$ . The energy requirement of FNF varies with the organism, energy source, and environmental factors. For instance, photosynthetic organisms can attain the required energy by the natural process of photosynthesis. For heterotrophic microorganisms, required energy is solely obtained from the catabolic activities of the organic substrate. A lower C/N ratio in the substrate and presence of  $O_2$  is associated with decreasing capacity of FNF<sup>[87]</sup>.

#### **Nutrient availability**

Nutrient limitations are related to enzymatic requirements and are therefore considered an overriding control over N fixation<sup>[88]</sup>. Low phosphorous (P) availability constrains the rate of FNF by affecting ATP and regulating nitrogenase enzyme<sup>[89–91]</sup>. One previous study suggested that FNF is ~27% higher in soils receiving P inputs over an unamended control<sup>[92]</sup>. Similar positive associations between P inputs and FNF have also been reported in tropical forest systems<sup>[12]</sup>. Wurzburger et al.<sup>[93]</sup> found that P availability can influence soil Mo availability and thus limit FNF in P-depleted soils. Carbon (C) are also known to limit N fixation<sup>[90,94–96,97]</sup>. In *Clostridium*  *pasteurianum*, FNF is inhibited by deficiency of C. Moreover, FNF is also affected by the C quality of the substrate. For example, acetate appears to impede nitrogenase activity of *Azotobacter paspali*<sup>[94–96,97]</sup>.

The availability of inorganic N decreases the rate of FNF. Moreover, lower N/P ratio is associated with higher rates of FNF by soil-dwelling bacteria<sup>[98–101]</sup>. In contrast to the stimulatory effect observed with P fertilization, N fertilization has an inhibitory effect on N fixation<sup>[102]</sup>. The rate of FNF is higher under N-limiting conditions<sup>[72]</sup>. Under severe Nlimiting conditions, microorganisms meet their N demands through fixing atmospheric N via obtaining exogenous N or by the re-allocation of endogenous N<sup>[103]</sup>. Exogeneous sources of N in the form ammonium, glutamine, and histidine are known to decrease the FNF rate in soils<sup>[104]</sup>. Research has shown that ammonium and glutamine act as inhibitors of nitrogenase enzyme synthesis through regulation of *nifA* gene expression. Nitrate can also decrease FNF in *A. brasilense*, while in *C. watsonii* no inhibition was observed<sup>[105]</sup>.

#### **Edaphic factors**

Temperature has been shown to inhibit nitrogenase activity and thus restrain FNF, with maximum rates occurring at ~26 °C, depending on species and ecosystem<sup>[106]</sup>. Insufficient soil moisture might limit the capacity of diazotrophs for N fixation due to altering O<sub>2</sub> availability. Soil texture can affect O<sub>2</sub> concentrations and the rate of substrate diffusion in soils<sup>[107]</sup>. Soils with high clay content are estimated to have high N fixation rates due to low O2 pressure on the diazotrophs<sup>[107]</sup>. Moreover, soil pH has an influence on the abundance and diversity of diazotrophs<sup>[108,109]</sup>. Although soils contaminated with heavy metals have depressive effects on rhizosphere microbial communities<sup>[110]</sup>, their effects on freeliving N fixers and the rate of FNF are poorly understood. Land use adoptions also alter the diversity of free-living bacteria<sup>[111,112]</sup>. The abundance and diversity of free-living N fixers have drastically changed alongside the deforestation of the Amazon rainforest<sup>[113,114]</sup>. Additionally, plants can alter FNF rates via various indirect mechanisms<sup>[115-117]</sup>. For example, Cotta et al.[118] mentioned that planting genetically modified maize significantly changes the abundance of Nfixing bacterial and archaeal communities.

# **Ecosystem contribution by FNF**

#### **FNF in terrestrial ecosystems**

FNF is a ubiquitous phenomenon of terrestrial ecosystems occurring on plant surfaces, litter, decaying logs, and in soils<sup>[12]</sup>. *Cyanobacteria* are the dominant N-fixers in terrestrial ecosystem because of their ability to colonize extreme environments ranging from deserts to tundra<sup>[23]</sup>. The N inputs by FNF to the total N budget of an ecosystem can vary due to ecosystem and community-level patterns of bacteria. According to Reed et al.<sup>[12]</sup>, FNF contributes to 1–20 kg N ha<sup>-1</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup> at the biome scale, and symbiotic N fixation reaches as high 150 kg N ha<sup>-1</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup>. The rate of N fixation by heterotrophic bacteria alone ranges from 1 to 5 kg ha<sup>-1</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup> for decomposing litter in different ecosystems, while the rate of *Cyanobacteria* ranges between 1 and 10 kg ha<sup>-1</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup>[94,119]. The estimated range of N fixed by FNF is > 10 kg N ha<sup>-1</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup>

for tropical rain forests<sup>[120,121]</sup>, 4 kg N ha<sup>-1</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup> for desert ecosystems, and > 2 kg N ha<sup>-1</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup> for tundra and boreal forests<sup>[122,66]</sup>. Research has revealed that FNF bacteria add 2 kg N ha<sup>-1</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup> in the soils of semiarid grasslands in California. Although these rates of FNF are far below symbiotic N fixation, FNF could nonetheless supply a meaningful amount of N to the total N budget of a particular ecosystem in the long term.

# FNF in agroecosystems

Contributions to total N needed in agricultural systems might not be primarily fulfilled by FNF. However, it can fulfill a substantial amount of the total N requirement of crops<sup>[62,123]</sup>. Studies have shown that N fixed by free-living *Cyanobacteria* in rice paddies is ~12–33 kg N ha<sup>-1</sup> in a cropping season<sup>[124]</sup>, ~25–150 kg N ha<sup>-1</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup> in sugarcane<sup>[8,68]</sup>, 20 kg ha<sup>-1</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup> in wheat, < 10 kg N ha<sup>-1</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup> in extensive tropical savannas used for grazing<sup>[119,125]</sup>, and < 5 kg N ha<sup>-1</sup> yr<sup>-1</sup> in croplands other than leguminous crops<sup>[126]</sup>. The agronomic effects of FNF on crops have provided useful model-systems for rhizosphere studies, plant-microbe interactions, and environmentally sound agricultural cultivation. Sustainable agriculture requires smarter utilization of FNF, which can offer a sound means of reducing external N input; therefore, future research into agroecological sustainability should focus on FNF.

#### **FNF** in aquatic ecosystems

N fixation in aquatic ecosystems also cannot be overlooked<sup>[127]</sup>. Microorganisms with the capability to fix N have been detected across various aquatic environments<sup>[100,128,129]</sup>. In these environments, cyanobacteria are the dominant diazotrophs<sup>[130]</sup>. Previous studies reported N fixation and diazotrophs in lakes, but these studies neglected to highlight the contribution of FNF. For example, MacGregor et al.[131] detected N fixation below the photic zone in oligotrophic Lake Michigan, but actual rates remain unknown. A study conducted in an oligotrophic, hypersaline, meromictic lake in California showed that anaerobic bacteria possessing significant potential for N fixation were present across all depths<sup>[132]</sup>. In the deep water of Lake Michigan, N fixation was also found to be an important source of N<sup>[131]</sup>. A study conducted in Lake George in New York State disclosed that a diverse group of diazotrophs, including unicellular and filamentous cyanobateria, alpha- and gamma-proteobacteria, and an undefined group of bacteria were found in the lake. Again, the actual rate of N fixation was not measured<sup>[133]</sup>.

On the other hand, in oceanic areas, a significant portion of N fixation is interceded by cyanobacteria and anaerobic bacteria<sup>[134,135]</sup>. Montoya et al.<sup>[136]</sup> showed that in the tropical North, N fixation supplies a substantial amount of N. Similar phenomena of N fixation exist in the Mediterranean Sea<sup>[137]</sup>; however, no past studies targeted FNF contributions in oceanic environment.

#### FNF measuring methods and their limitations

#### Acetylene reduction method

Acetylene reduction has been used to quantify FNF, which follows the principle of no specificity of nitrogenase. The reduction of acetylene is carried out by nitrogenase, which produces ethylene. Then, ethylene production is quantified by gas chromatography coupled with a flame ionization detector. Finally, the acetylene reduction rate is converted into a rate of reduction of N2. About one mole of N2 is reduced by three moles of acetylene. During N fixation, hydrogen evolution, which involves electron transfer, occurs. The general conversion factor is 4:1<sup>[3,138]</sup> and can vary across natural environments<sup>[139,140]</sup>. Acetylene reduction assay has several limitations: 1) during acetylene reduction assay, microorganisms may become N-deprived and can perhaps reduce more acetylene<sup>[138]</sup>; 2) acetylene is not suitable for some microbes like methanotrophic bacteria because they cannot tolerate acetylene due to interference with methanogenesis that can cause starvation or death of the microbe<sup>[141]</sup>; and 3) three different types of nitrogenases vary in their affinity for the substrate acetylene, consequently producing different acetvlene reduction rates that could lead to the misinterpretation of FNF rates in a natural system.

# <sup>15</sup>N-tracer method

The <sup>15</sup>N-tracer method has become a widely adopted method in modern research<sup>[6]</sup>. This method utilizes the <sup>15</sup>N stable-isotope that occurs naturally in small amounts. The FNF organism is given <sup>15</sup>N<sub>2</sub>, and the incorporated isotope in the particulate organic N is quantified via stable-isotope mass spectrometer<sup>[142]</sup>. This method is more reliable relative to the acetylene reduction method, as this directly measures N fixation.<sup>[142]</sup>. However, the <sup>15</sup>N-tracer method purely quantifies net N fixation. Thus, biased results may occur where N fixation is vigorous, and there is only partial release of the fixed N by microorganisms<sup>[143]</sup>.

#### Stable isotope abundance method

The natural abundance of stable isotopes (<sup>14</sup>N and <sup>15</sup>N) is another method that can be used to quantify the FNF of N. <sup>14</sup>N is a lighter isotope that is preferred over <sup>15</sup>N in chemical reactions, as the bonds of the <sup>14</sup>N are easily broken, leading to substrates featuring greater enrichment of <sup>15</sup>N<sup>[144,145]</sup>. For N<sub>2</sub>, the  $\delta^{15}$ N value is normally 0%. The  $\delta^{15}$ N value of an organism approaching 0% indicates a fixation of N. Many aquatic environments like lakes and oceans facilitate this phenomenon<sup>[146,147]</sup>. The stable isotope abundance method is not usually suggested because it misses volumetric N fixation rate, and in many cases, the N sources may not be precisely known.

#### **Gene markers**

The nif genes have been widely used as a marker for studying the identification, guantification, diversity, and phylogenies of bacteria in various environments<sup>[148–152]</sup>. PCRbased amplification and sequencing of *nifH* DNA have been used for detecting non-cultural, soil-borne microorganisms<sup>[153]</sup>. Many correlation studies revealed the effects of environmental factors, plant genotypes, and nutritional availability on the diversity and abundance of the nifH gene<sup>[148,154]</sup>. Although the *nifH* gene is highly conserved, it is not necessarily a true indicator of actual N fixation because these genes are prone to mutate and may ultimately be excluded from the genome<sup>[155,156]</sup>. Finally, three types of nitrogenases are produced by separate genes, i.e., nifH encodes for Mo-nitrogenase, anfH for Fe-nitrogenase and vnfH for V-nitrogenase; therefore, measurements based solely on *nifH* abundance may lead to biased interpretations.

# Consequences of anthropogenic activities on N fixation

The productivity and dynamics of any ecosystem are limited by the supply of biologically available N<sup>[157,158]</sup>. It is well known that anthropogenic activities are constantly altering the global N cycle<sup>[159]</sup>. Over-use of fertilizer in agriculture is a factor that has approximately doubled the rate of N input into terrestrial ecosystems<sup>[160]</sup>. This has resulted in the acidification of soils as well as the unbalancing and loss of soil nutrients that are essential for the maintenance of soil fertility<sup>[161]</sup>. The estimated total production of N from synthetic fertilizer is 120 Tq N yr<sup>-1</sup>, which represents the largest contribution of Nr to the atmosphere. Furthermore, the wide cultivation of leguminous crops contributes an additional 60 Tg N yr<sup>-1</sup>. N in oxidized forms (NO and NO<sub>2</sub>) as a byproduct from automobile combustion and industrial emissions adds an additional 40 Tg N yr<sup>-1</sup> to the atmosphere. The estimated anthropogenic production of Nr is therefore 180 ( $\pm$  20) Tg N yr<sup>-1[4,160,162]</sup>. The emission of Nr by natural as well as anthropogenic activities is expected to increase in the future (Fig. 1). It is also reasonable to expect that with global population growth the demand for food and feed will increase the production of reduced N in the form of N fertilizers that would require greater fossil fuels combustion. The future emission of NOx is highly uncertain, and it is expected to increase alongside industrial developments until abated by pollution controls. According to Fowler et al.[160] the N input to ecosystems via natural and anthropogenic fixation will increase in the future (Fig. 2). Increasing N availability generally reduces the biological diversity of ecosystems<sup>[163]</sup>, which in turn affects the rates of various biological processes. The increasing level of N in soils is known to inhibit the growth of symbiotic as well as free-living organisms<sup>[164]</sup>. Nitrogen addition has obvious effects on the C pool of the ecosystem<sup>[158]</sup>. Excessive nitrogen deposition favors the uptake and storage of carbon. This high C sequestration will demand high N input, which will likely be insufficient in the future if N addition as N<sub>2</sub> fixation is controlled by resources that do not contain N.<sup>[22,165]</sup>. Therefore, there is a need to increase BNF to meet the N supply required to balance the increased C. The expanded utilization of BNF will reduce the dependence on synthetic N, which in turn will reduce the negative effects on biogeoche-



**Fig. 1** Anthropogenic contribution of  $N_r$  to the atmosphere<sup>[160]</sup>.



Fig. 2 Changes in N fixation in the coming future<sup>[160]</sup>.

mical cycles. FNF may compensate N losses through denitrification, increasing soil phosphate levels by altering phosphatase activity, and increasing the net primary productivity of terrestrial ecosystems<sup>[12,91]</sup>.

# **Conclusions and future research directions**

It is now established that anthropogenic activities have increased the total global N deposition. This has destabilized biogeochemical cycles, including the N cycle. However, to accurately address the effects of anthropogenic activities on the N cycle, we need a detailed understanding of the FNF process. Overall, available research has concluded that FNF is a ubiquitous phenomenon across ecosystems that contributes significantly to the N inputs of a range of ecosystems. Based on knowledge gaps, we suggest that future research in the following mentioned areas will increase our understanding of FNF:

The crucial need is to resolve uncertainties in observing N<sub>2</sub> fixation rate per unit area along with spatial distribution of the N fixing bacterial species. Previously, authors have reported global N fixation across various ecosystems; however, most of these studies were unable to investigate several ecosystems<sup>[12,119,162]</sup>. Recently, research has produced more accurate findings regarding cultivated and uncultivated lands, using data from different sources<sup>[12,6,162]</sup>. Additionally,

Net primary productivity

Ecosystem response toclimate change

none of the studies take into account the constraints that FNF bacteria encounter in their life cycle. In fact, methodological constraints, spatiotemporal variation of the process, and complex interactions between plants, microbes, and environments do not allow us to develop conclusive estimates for overall fixation rates in nature and/or agroecosystems. We suggest that site- and situation-specific research is necessary to obtain real estimates on a granular scale. This can be achieved by wisely designed models that consider the dynamics, heterogeneity, influences, and existing constrains to N fixation by free-living N-fixing bacteria. Thus, we propose a framework for gaining a better understanding of FNF (Fig. 3). Another essential issue in need of clarification is the ecology of FNF bacteria. We urgently need to deepen our understanding of the numerous factors, including biotic and abiotic, that affect the diversity and abundance of FNF bacteria in the rhizosphere, which in turn influence the rate of N fixation.

# Acknowledgments

Our work was funded by the Key Project from the Ministry of Sciences and Technology of China (No. 2017YFC0505100). We are grateful to the Chinese Academy of Sciences for CAS-President's International Fellowship Initiative (CAS-PIFI), Fellowship (Grant No. 2019PC0011 and 2021PB00094).

#### **Rates and Patterns**

- · Genetic/physiological/ecological controls
- · Spatio-temporal/chronological variation
- Community structure and abundance
- Methodological constrains
- · Anthropogenic activities



### **Approaches/ Utilizations**

- Basic and advanced knowledge
- · Utilization approaches and Biotechnology

**Fig. 3** Framework for expanded utilization of FNF.

Recognition

The authors declare that they have no conflict of interest.

# Dates

Received 8 August 2021; Accepted 27 October 2021; Published online 30 November 2021

# REFERENCES

- 1. Postgate JR. 1982. *The fundamentals of nitrogen fixation*. Cambridge University Press: UK
- Rees DC, Tezcan FA, Haynes CA, Walton MY, Andrade S, et al. 2005. Structural basis of biological nitrogen fixation. *Philosophical Transactions Series A, Mathematical, Physical, and Engineering Sciences* 363:971–84
- 3. Capone DG, Popa R, Flood B, Nealson KH. 2006. Follow the nitrogen. *Science* 312:708–9
- Fowler D, Coyle M, Skiba U, Sutton MA, Cape JN, et al. 2013. The global nitrogen cycle in the twenty-first century. *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences* 368:20130164
- Lee CC, Hu Y, Ribbe MW. 2009. Unique features of the nitrogenase VFe protein from *Azotobacter vinelandii*. *PNAS* 106:9209–14
- Unkovich M. 2013. Isotope discrimination provides new insight into biological nitrogen fixation. *New Phytologist* 198:643–6
- Mus F, Crook MB, Garcia K, Costas AG, Geddes BA, et al. 2016. Symbiotic nitrogen fixation and the challenges to its extension to nonlegumes. *Applied and Environmental Microbiology* 82:3698–710
- Urquiaga S, Cruz KHS, Boddey RM. 1992. Contribution of nitrogen fixation to sugar cane: nitrogen-15 and nitrogen-balance estimates. Soil Science Society of America Journal 56:105–114
- Reed SC, Townsend AR, Cleveland CC, Nemergut DR. 2010. Microbial community shifts influence patterns in tropical forest nitrogen fixation. *Oecologia* 264:521–31
- Steunou AS, Bhaya D, Bateson MM, Melendrez MC, Ward DM, et al. 2006. *In situ* analysis of nitrogen fixation and metabolic switching in unicellular thermophilic cyanobacteria inhabiting hot spring microbial mats. *PNAS* 14:2398–403
- 11. Barron AR, Purves DW, Hedin LO. 2011. Facultative nitrogen fixation by canopy legumes in a lowland tropical forest. *Oecologia* 165:511–20
- 12. Reed SC, Cleveland CC, Townsend AR. 2011. Functional ecology of free-living nitrogen fixation: a contemporary perspective. *Annual Review of Ecology, Evolution, and Systematics* 42:489–512
- Lancaster KM, Roemelt M, Ettenhuber P, Hu Y, Ribbe MW, et al. 2011. X-ray emission spectroscopy evidences a central carbon in the nitrogenase iron-molybdenum cofactor. *Science* 334:974–977
- Rao VR, Ramakrishnan B, Adhya TK, Kanungo PK, Nayak DN. 1998. Review: Current status and future prospects of associative nitrogen fixation in rice. *World Journal of Microbiology and Biotechnology* 14:621–33
- Bates ST, Cropsey GWG, Caporaso JG, Knight R, Fierer N. 2011. Bacterial communities associated with the lichen symbiosis. *Applied and Environmental Microbiology* 77:1309–1314
- Sigurbjörnsdóttir MA, Andrésson ÓS. 2016. Nutrient scavenging activity and antagonistic factors of non-photobiont lichen-associated bacteria: A review. World Journal of Microbiology & Biotechnology 32:68
- 17. Leigh JA. 2000. Nitrogen fixation in methanogens: the archaeal perspective. *Current Issues in Molecular Biology* 2:125–31

- Smercina DN, Evans SE, Friesen ML, Tiemann LK. 2019. To fix or not to fix: controls on free-living nitrogen-fixation in the rhizosphere. *Applied and Environmenta Microbiology* 85:e02546-18
- 19. Stewart WDP. 1975. *Nitrogen fixation by free living bacteria*. UK: Cambridge University press
- 20. Cleveland CC, Reed SC, Townsend AR. 2006. Nutrient regulation of organic matter decomposition in a tropical rain forest. *Ecology* 87:492–503
- Unkovich M, Baldock J. 2008. Measurement of asymbiotic N<sub>2</sub> fixation in Australian agriculture. Soil Biology and Biochemistry 40:2915–21
- 22. Vitousek PM, Menge DNL, Reed SC, Cleveland CC. 2013. Biological nitrogen fixation: rates, patterns and ecological controls in terrestrial ecosystems. *hilosophical Transactions of the Royal Society of London Series B, Biological Sciences* 368:20130119
- Vitousek PM, Cassman K, Cleveland C, Crews T, Field CB, et al. 2002. Towards an ecological understanding of biological nitrogen fixation. In *The Nitrogen Cycle at Regional to Global Scales*, eds. Boyer EW, Howarth RW. Netherlands: Springer, Dordrecht. pp. 1–45 https://doi.org/10.1007/978-94-017-3405-9\_1
- Eckford R, Cook FD, Saul D, Aislabie J, Foght J. 2002. Free-living heterotrophic nitrogen-fixing bacteria isolated from fuelcontaminated Antarctic soils. *Applied and Environmental Microbiology* 68:5181–85
- Seneviratne G, Indrasena IK. 2006. Nitrogen fixation in lichens is important for improved rock weathering. *Journal of Biosciences* 31:639–43
- Crews TE, Kurina LM, Vitousek PM. 2001. Organic matter and nitrogen accumulation and nitrogen fixation during early ecosystem development in Hawaii. *Biogeochemistry* 52:259–79
- Benner JW, Vitousek PM. 2007. Development of a diverse epiphyte community in response to phosphorus fertilization. *Ecology Letters* 10:628–36
- Rees DC, Howard JB. 2000. Nitrogenase: standing at the crossroads. *Current Opinion in Chemical Biology* 4:559–66
- 29. Hu Y, Ribbe MW. 2015. Nitrogenase and homologs. *Journal* of *Biological Inorganic Chemistry* 20:435–45
- Hofmann-Findeklee C, Gadkari D, Meyer O. 2000. Superoxidedependent nitrogen fixation. In *Nitrogen fixation: From Molecules to Crop Productivity*, eds. Pedrosa FO, Hungria M, Yates G, Newton WE. Dordrecht: Springer, Kluwer Academic Publishers. pp. 23–30 https://doi.org/10.1007/0-306-47615-0\_5
- 31. Ribbe M, Gadkari D, Meyer O. 1997. N<sub>2</sub> fixation by *Streptomyces thermoautotrophicus* involves a molybdenum-dinitrogenase and a manganese-superoxide oxidoreductase that couple N<sub>2</sub> reduction to the oxidation of superoxide produced from O<sub>2</sub> by a molybdenum-CO dehydrogenase. *Journal of Biological Chemistry* 272:26627–33
- Zhao Y, Bian SM, Zhou HN, Huang JF. 2006. Diversity of nitrogenase systems in diazotrophs. *Journal of Integrative Plant Biology* 48:745–55
- Howard JB, Rees DC. 1996. Structural basis of biological nitrogen fixation. *Chemical Reviews* 96:2965–82
- Schindelin H, Kisker C, Schlessman JL, Howard JB, Rees DC. 1997. Structure of ADP·AIF<sub>4</sub><sup>-</sup>-stabilized nitrogenase complex and its implications for signal transduction. *Nature* 387:370–76
- Einsle O, Tezcan FA, Andrade SLA, Schmid B, Yoshida M, et al. 2002. Nitrogenase MoFe-protein at 1.16 Å resolution: a central ligand in the FeMo-cofactor. *Science* 297:1696–700
- Schneider K, Müller A. 2004. Iron-only nitrogenase: exceptional catalytic, structural and spectroscopic features. In *Catalysts for Nitrogen Fixation*, eds. Smith BE, Richards RL, Newton WE. Netherlands: Springer, Dordrecht. pp. 281–307 https://doi.org/ 10.1007/978-1-4020-3611-8\_11

Khan et al. Circular Agricultural Systems 2021, 1:13

- Chan MK, Kim J, Rees DC. 1993. The nitrogenase FeMo-cofactor and P-cluster pair: 2.2 Å resolution structures. *Science* 260:792–94
- Christiansen J, Seefeldt LC, Dean DR. 2000. Competitive substrate and inhibitor interactions at the physiologically relevant active site of nitrogenase. *The Journal of Biological Chemistry* 275:36104–7
- Glazer AN, Kechris K, Howard JB. 2015. Distribution and ecological niches of nitrogenases. In *Biological Nitrogen Fixation*, ed. de Bruijn FJ. Hoboken, New Jersey: John Wiley & Sons. pp. 87–98 https://doi.org/10.1002/9781119053095.ch8
- Newton WE. 2015. Recent advances in understanding nitrogenases and how they work. In *Biological Nitrogen Fixation*, ed. de Bruijn FJ. Hoboken, New Jersey: John Wiley & Sons. pp. 5–20 https://doi.org/10.1002/9781119053095.ch2
- 41. Halbleib CM, Ludden PW. 2000. Regulation of biological nitrogen fixation. *The Journal of Nutrition* 130:1081–84
- 42. Seefeldt LC, Hoffman BM, Dean DR. 2009. Mechanism of Modependent nitrogenase. *Annual Review of Biochemistry* 78:701–22
- 43. Bishop PE, Jarlenski DM, Hetherington DR. 1980. Evidence for an alternative nitrogen fixation system in Asotobacter vinelandii. *PNAS* 77:7342–46
- 44. Miller RW, Eady RR. 1988. Molybdenum and vanadium nitrogenases of Azotobacter chroococcum. Low temperature favours  $N_2$  reduction by vanadium nitrogenase. The Biochemical Journal 256:429–32
- 45. Dixon R, Kahn D. 2004. Genetic regulation of biological nitrogen fixation. *Nature Reviews Microbiology* 2:621–31
- 46. Grabbe R, Schmitz RA. 2003. Oxygen control of *nif* gene expression in *Klebsiella pneumoniae* depends on NifL reduction at the cytoplasmic membrane by electrons derived from the reduced quinone pool. *European Journal of Biochemistry* 270:1555–66
- 47. Barrett J, Ray P, Sobczyk A, Little R, Dixon R. 2001. Concerted inhibition of the transcriptional activation functions of the enhancer-binding protein NIFA by the anti-activator NIFL. *Molecular Microbiology* 39:480–94
- Martinez-Argudo I, Little R, Shearer N, Johnson P, Dixon R. 2004. The NifL-NifA system: a multidomain transcriptional regulatory complex that integrates environmental signals. *Journal of Bacteriology* 186:601–10
- De-Bruijn FJ, Hilgert U, Stigter J, Schneider M, Meyer H, et al. 1990. Regulation of nitrogen fixation and assimilation genes in the free-living versus symbiotic state. In Nitrogen Fixation, eds. Gresshoff PM, Roth LE, Stacey G, Newton WE. Boston, MA: Springer. pp. 33–44 https://doi.org/10.1007/978-1-4684-6432-0\_4
- 50. Jack R, De Zamaroczy M, Merrick M. 1999. The signal transduction protein GlnK is required for NifL-dependent nitrogen control of *nif* gene expression in *Klebsiella pneumoniae*. *Journal of Bacteriology* 181:1156–62
- 51. Colnaghi R, Rudnick P, He L, Green A, Yan D, et al. 2001. Lethality of *glnD* null mutations in *Azotobacter vinelandii* is suppressible by prevention of glutamine synthetase adenylylation. *Microbiology* 147:1267–76
- 52. Rudnick P, Kunz C, Gunatilaka MK, Hines ER, Kennedy C. 2002. Role of GlnK in NifL-mediated regulation of NifA activity in *Azotobacter vinelandii. Journal of Bacteriology* 184:812–20
- 53. Little R, Dixon R. 2003. The amino-terminal GAF domain of *Azotobacter vinelandii* NifA binds 2-Oxoglutarate to resist inhibition by NifL under nitrogen-limiting conditions. *Journal of Biological Chemistry* 278:28711–18
- Poza-Carrión C, Echavarri-Erasun C, Rubio LM. 2015. Regulation of nif Gene Expression in Azotobacter vinelandii. In Biological Nitrogen Fixation, ed. de Bruijn FJ. Hoboken, New Jersey: John Wiley & Sons. pp. 99–108 https://doi.org/10.1002/97811190 53095.ch9

- Arsène F, Kaminski PA, Elmerich C. 1999. Control of Azospirillum brasilense NifA activity by P<sub>II</sub>: effect of replacing Tyr residues of the NifA N-terminal domain on NifA activity. FEMS Microbiology Letters 179:339–43
- Zhang Y, Pohlmann EL, Roberts GP. 2004. Identification of critical residues in GlnB for its activation of NifA activity in the photosynthetic bacterium Rhodospirillum rubrum. *PNAS* 101:2782–87
- 57. Huergo LF, Pedrosa FO, Muller-Santos M, Chubatsu LS, Monteiro RA, et al. 2012. Pll signal transduction proteins: pivotal players in post-translational control of nitrogenase activity. *Microbiology* 158:176–90
- 58. Merrick MJ. 1983. Nitrogen control of the *nif* regulon in *Klebsiella pneumoniae*: involvement of the *ntrA* gene and analogies between *ntrC* and *nifA*. *The EMBO Journal* 21:39–44
- 59. Apte SK, Prabhavathi N. 1994. Rearrangements of nitrogen fixation (*nif*) genes in the heterocystous cyanobacteria. *Journal of Biosciences* 19:579–602
- 60. Kallas T, Coursin T, Rippka R. 1985. Different organization of nif genes in nonheterocystous and heterocystous cyanobacteria. *Plant Molecular Biology* 5:321
- 61. Wagner SC. 2011. Biological nitrogen fixation. *Nature Education Knowledge* 3:15
- 62. Belnap J. 2002. Nitrogen fixation in biological soil crusts from southeast Utah, USA. *Biology and Fertility of Soils* 35:128–35
- Abed RMM, Al Kharusi S, Schramm A, Robinson MD. 2010. Bacterial diversity, pigments and nitrogen fixation of biological desert crusts from the Sultanate of Oman. *FEMS Microbiology Ecology* 72:418–28
- Büdel B, Colesie C, Green TGA, Grube M, Suau RL, et al. 2014. Improved appreciation of the functioning and importance of biological soil crusts in Europe: the Soil Crust International Project (SCIN). *Biodiversity and Conservation* 23:1639–58
- 65. Nunes da Rocha U, Cadillo-Quiroz H, Karaoz U, Rajeev L, Klitgord N, et al. 2015. Isolation of a significant fraction of nonphototroph diversity from a desert Biological Soil Crust. *Frontiers in Microbiology* 6:277
- DeLuca TH, Zackrisson O, Gundale MJ, Nilsson MC. 2008. Ecosystem feedbacks and nitrogen fixation in boreal forests. *Science* 320:1181
- 67. Smil V. 1999. Nitrogen in crop production: an account of global flows. *Global Biogeochemical Cycles* 13:647–62
- Reis V, Lee S, Kennedy C. 2007. Biological nitrogen fixation in sugarcane. In Associative and Endophytic Nitrogen-fixing Bacteria and Cyanobacterial Associations, ed. Emerich C, Newton WE.Dordrecht:Springer,Netherlands.pp.213–232https://doi.org/ 10.1007/1-4020-3546-2\_10
- Billings SA, Schaeffer SM, Evans RD. 2003. Nitrogen fixation by biological soil crusts and heterotrophic bacteria in an intact Mojave Desert ecosystem with elevated CO<sub>2</sub> and added soil carbon. *Soil Biology and Biochemistry* 35:643–49
- Reed SC, Cleveland CC, Townsend AR. 2008. Tree species control rates of free-living nitrogen fixation in a tropical rain forest. *Ecology* 89:2924–34
- 71. Matson AL, Corre MD, Burneo JI, Veldkamp E. 2015. Free-living nitrogen fixation responds to elevated nutrient inputs in tropical montane forest floor and canopy soils of southern Ecuador. *Biogeochemistry* 122:281–94
- Blossfeld S, Gansert D, Thiele B, Kuhn AJ, Lösch R. 2011. The dynamics of oxygen concentration, pH value, and organic acids in the rhizosphere of Juncus spp. *Soil Biology and Biochemistry* 43:1186–97
- Fay P. 1992. Oxygen relations of nitrogen fixation in cyanobacteria. *Microbiological Reviews* 56:340–73
- 74. Gallon RJ. 1992. Reconciling the incompatible:  $N_2$  fixation and  $O_2$ . New Phytologist 122:571–609

- 75. Marchal K, Vanderleyden J. 2000. The "oxygen paradox" of dinitrogen-fixing bacteria. *Biology and Fertility of Soils* 30:363–373
- Poole RK, Hill S. 1997. Respiratory protection of nitrogenase activity in *Azotobacter vinelandii* – roles of the terminal oxidases. *Bioscience Reports* 17:303–17
- 77. Burgess BK, Lowe DJ. 1996. Mechanism of molybdenum nitrogenase. *Chemical Reviews* 96:2983–3012
- 78. Eady RR. 1996. Structure-function relationships of alternative nitrogenases. *Chemical Reviews* 96:3013–30
- Hu Y, Ribbe MW. 2011. Biosynthesis of the metalloclusters of Mo-lybdenum nitrogenase. *Microbiology and Molecular Biology Reviews* 75:664–67
- 80. Igarashi RY, Seefeldt LC. 2003. Nitrogen fixation: the mechanism of the Modependent nitrogenase. *Critical Reviews in Biochemistry and Molecular Biology* 38:351–84
- Barron AR, Wurzburger N, Bellenger JP, Wright SJ, Kraepiel AML, et al. 2008. Molybdenum limitation of asymbiotic nitrogen fixation in tropical forest soils. *Nature Geoscience* 2:42–45
- Bellenger JP, Wichard T, Xu Y, Kraepiel AML. 2011. Essential metals for nitrogen fixation in a free-living N<sub>2</sub>-fixing bacterium: chelation, homeostasis and high use efficiency. *Environmental Microbiology* 13:1395–411
- Bellenger JP, Xu Y, Zhang X, Morel FMM, Kraepiel AML. 2014. Possible contribution of alternative nitrogenases to nitrogen fixation by asymbiotic N<sub>2</sub>-fixing bacteria in soils. Soil Biology and Biochemistry 69:413–420
- Mudler EG. 1979. Physiology and ecology of freeliving nitrogen fixing bacteria. In *Nitrogen fixation by free-living micro-organisms*, ed. Stewart WDP. Cambridge: Cambridge University press. pp. 3–28
- Mortenson LE. 1964. Ferredoxin and ATP, requirements for nitrogen fixation in cell-free extracts of Clostridium pasteurianum. *PNAS* 52:272–79
- Figg TM, Holland PL, Cundari TR. 2012. Cooperativity between low-valent iron and potassium promoters in dinitrogen fixation. *Inorganic Chemistry* 51:7546–50
- Hill S. 1992. Physiology of nitrogen fixation in free-living heterotrophs. In *Biological Nitrogen Fixation*, ed. Stacey G, Burris RH, Evans J. New York: Chapman and Hall. pp. 87–129
- Dynarski KA, Houlton BZ. 2017. Nutrient limitation of terrestrial free-living nitrogen fixation. *New Phytologist* 217:1050–61
- 89. Thompson MV, Vitousek PM. 1997. Asymbiotic nitrogen fixation and litter decomposition on a long soil-age gradient in Hawaiian montane rain forest. *Biotropica* 29:134–44
- Vitousek PM, Hobbie S. 2000. Heterotrophic nitrogen fixation in decomposing litter: patterns and regulation. *Ecology* 81:2366–76
- Benner JW, Conroy S, Lunch CK, Toyoda N, Vitousek PM. 2007. Phosphorus fertilization increases the abundance and nitrogenase activity of the cyanolichen *Pseudocyphell ariacrocata* in Hawaiian montane forests. *Biotropica* 39:400–5
- Zheng M, Li D, Lu X, Zhu X, Zhang W, Huang J, Mo J. 2016. Effects of phosphorus addition with and without nitrogen addition on biological nitrogen fixation in tropical legume and non-legume tree plantations. *Biogeochemistry* 131:65–76
- Wurzburger N, Bellenger JP, Kraepiel AML, Hedin LO. 2012. Molybdenum and phosphorus interact to constrain asymbiotic nitrogen fixation in tropical forests. *PloS One* 7:e33710
- Jones K, Bangs D. 1985. Nitrogen fixation by free-living heterotrophic bacteria in an oak forest: The effect of liming. *Soil Biology and Biochemistry* 175:705–9
- 95. Maheswaran J, Gunatilleke IAUN. 1990. Nitrogenase activity in soil and litter of a tropical lowland rain forest and an adjacent fernland in *Sri Lanka. Journal of Tropical Ecology* 6:281–89
- 96. Hofmockel KS, Schlesinger WH. 2007. Carbon dioxide effects on heterotrophic dinitrogen fixation in a temperate pine forest. *Soil Science Society of America Journal* 71:140–44

- Pérez CA, Carmona MR, Armesto JJ. 2010. Non-symbiotic nitrogen fixation during leaf litter decomposition in an oldgrowth temperate rain forest of Chiloé Island, southern Chile: effects of single *versus* mixed species litter. *Austral Ecology* 35:148–56
- Eisele KA, Schimel DS, Kapustka LA, Parton WJ. 1989. Effects of available P and N: P ratios on non-symbiotic dinitrogen fixation in tallgrass prairie soils. *Oecologia* 79:471–74
- Chapin DM, Bliss LC, Bledsoe LJ. 1991. Environmental regulation of nitrogen fixation in a high arctic lowland ecosystem. *Canadian Journal of Botany* 69:2744–55
- 100. Arrigo KR. 2005. Marine microorganisms and global nutrient cycles. *Nature* 437:349–55
- Bowsher AW, Evans S, Tiemann LK, Friesen ML. 2018. Effects of soil nitrogen availability on rhizodeposition in plants: a review. *Plant and Soil* 423:59–85
- 102. Lindsay EA, Colloff MJ, Gibb NL, Wakelin SA. 2010. The abundance of microbial functional genes in grassy woodlands is influenced more by soil nutrient enrichment than by recent weed invasion or livestock exclusion. *Applied and Environmental Microbiology* 76:5547–55
- 103. Norman JS, Friesen ML. 2017. Complex N acquisition by soil diazotrophs: how the ability to release exoenzymes affects N fixation by terrestrial free-living diazotrophs. *The ISME Journal* 11:315–26
- 104. Kox MAR, Lüke C, Fritz C, van den Elzen E, van Alen T, et al. 2016. Effects of nitrogen fertilization on diazotrophic activity of microorganisms associated with Sphagnum magellanicum. Plant and Soil 406:83–100
- 105. Steenhoudt O, Vanderleyden J. 2000. Azospirillum, a free-living nitrogen-fixing bacterium closely associated with grasses: genetic, biochemical and ecological aspects. FEMS Microbiology Reviews 24:487–506
- Houlton BZ, Wang YP, Vitousek PM, Field CB. 2008. A unifying framework for dinitrogen fixation in the terrestrial biosphere. *Nature* 454:327–330
- 107. Gupta VVSR, Roper MM. 2010. Protection of free-living nitrogen-fixing bacteria within the soil matrix. *Soil and Tillage Research* 109:50–54
- 108. Girvan MS, Bullimore J, Pretty JN, Osborn AM, Ball AS. 2003. Soil type is the primary determinant of the composition of the total and active bacterial communities in arable soils. *Applied and Environmental Microbiology* 69:1800–9
- 109. Zhan J, Sun Q. 2011. Diversity of free-living nitrogen-fixing microorganisms in wastelands of copper mine tailings during the process of natural ecological restoration. *Journal of Environmental Sciences* 23:476–87
- 110. Sobolev D, Begonia MFT. 2008. Effects of heavy metal contamination upon soil microbes: lead-induced changes in general and denitrifying microbial communities as evidenced by molecular markers. *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health* 5:450–56
- 111. Huhe, Borjigin S, Cheng Y, Nomura N, Nakajima T, et al. 2014. Effect of abandonment on diversity and abundance of freeliving nitrogen-fixing bacteria and total bacteria in the cropland soils of Hulun Buir, Inner Mongolia. *PLoS One* 9:e106714
- 112. Orr CH, James A, Leifert C, Cooper JM, Cummings SP. 2011. Diversity and activity of free-living nitrogen-fixing bacteria and total bacteria in organic and conventionally managed soils. *Applied and Environmental Microbiology* 77:911–19
- 113. Davidson EA, de Carvalho CJR, Figueira AM, Ishida FY, Ometto JPHB, et al. 2007. Recuperation of nitrogen cycling in Amazonian forests following agricultural abandonment. *Nature* 447:995–98

Khan et al. Circular Agricultural Systems 2021, 1:13

- 114. Mirza BS, Potisap C, Nüsslein K, Bohannan BJM, Rodrigues JLM. 2014. Response of Free-Living Nitrogen-Fixing Microorganisms to Land Use Change in the Amazon Rainforest. *Applied and Environmental Microbiology* 80:281–88
- 115. Zhan J, Sun Q. 2012. Diversity of free-living nitrogen-fixing microorganisms in the rhizosphere and non-rhizosphere of pioneer plants growing on wastelands of copper mine tailings. *Microbiological Research* 167:157–165
- 116. Minett DA, Cook PLM, Kessler AJ, Cavagnaro TR. 2013. Root effects on the spatial and temporal dynamics of oxygen in sand-based laboratory-scale constructed biofilters. *Ecolog. Engin* 58:414–22
- 117. York LM, Carminati A, Mooney SJ, Ritz K, Bennett MJ. 2016. The holistic rhizosphere: integrating zones, processes, and semantics in the soil influenced by roots. *Journal of Experimental Botany* 67:3629–43
- 118. Cotta SR, Dias ACF, Marriel IE, Andreote FD, Seldin L, et al. 2014. Different effects of transgenic maize and non-transgenic maize on nitrogen-transforming archaea and bacteria in tropical soils. *Applied and Environmental Microbiology* 80:6437–6445
- Cleveland CC, Townsend AR, Schimel DS, Fisher H, Howarth RW, et al. 1999. Global patterns of terrestrial biological nitrogen (N<sub>2</sub>) fixation in natural ecosystems. *Global Biogeochemical Cycles* 13:623–45
- 120. Jordan C, Caskey W, Escalante G, Herrera R, Montagnini F, et al. 1983. Nitrogen dynamics during conversion of primary Amazonian rain forest to slash and burn agriculture. *Oikos* 40:131–139
- 121. Cusack DF, Silver W, McDowell WH. 2009. Biological nitrogen fixation in two tropical forests: ecosystem -level patterns and effects of nitrogen fertilization. *Ecosystems* 12:1299–315
- 122. DeLuca TH, Zackrisson O, Nilsson MC, Sellstedt A. 2002. Quantifying nitrogen-fixation in feather moss carpets of boreal forests. *Nature* 419:917–20
- 123. Yeager CM, Kornosky JL, Morgan RE, Cain EC, Garcia-Pichel F, et al. 2007. Three distinct clades of cultured heterocystous cyanobacteria constitute the dominant N<sub>2</sub>-fixing members of biological soil crusts of the Colorado Plateau, USA. FEMS Microbiology Ecology 60:85–97
- 124. Giller KE. 2001. Nitrogen fixation in tropical cropping systems, 2<sup>nd</sup> edition. 423pp. Wallingford: CABI. https://doi.org/10.1079/ 9780851994178.0000
- Bustamante MMC, Medina E, Asner GP, Nardoto GB, Garcia-Montiel DC. 2006. Nitrogen cycling in tropical and temperate savannas. *Biogeochemistry* 79:209–37
- 126. Herridge DF, Peoples MB, Boddey RM. 2008. Global inputs of biological nitrogen fixation in agricultural systems. *Plant and Soil* 311:1–18
- 127. Montoya JP, Holl CM, Zehr JP, Hansen A, Villareal TA, et al. 2004. High rates of  $N_2$  fixation by unicellular diazotrophs in the oligotrophic Pacific Ocean. *Nature* 430:1027–31
- 128. Falcón LI, Carpenter EJ, Cipriano F, Bergman B, Capone DG. 2004. N<sub>2</sub> fixation by unicellular bacterioplankton from the Atlantic and Pacific Oceans: phylogeny and *in situ* rates. *Applied* and Environmental Microbiology 70:765–770
- 129. Mehta MP, Baross JA. 2006. Nitrogen fixation at 92 °C by a hydrothermal vent archaeon. *Science* 314:1783–86
- Howarth RW, Marino R, Lane J, Cole JJ. 1988. Nitrogen fixation in freshwater, estuarine, and marine ecosystems. 1. Rates and importance. *Limnology and Oceanography* 33:669–87
- 131. MacGregor BJ, Van Mooy B, Baker BJ, Mellon M, Moisander PH, et al. 2001. Microbiological, molecular biological and stable isotopic evidence for nitrogen fixation in the open waters of Lake Michigan. *Environmental Microbiology* 3:205–219
- Steward GF, Zehr JP, Jellison R, Montoya JP, Hollibaugh JT. 2004. Vertical distribution of nitrogen-fixing phylotypes in a meromictic, hypersaline lake. *Microbial Ecology* 47:30–40

- 133. Zani S, Mellon MT, Collier JL, Zehr JP. 2000. Expression of *nifH* genes in natural microbial assemblages in Lake George, New York, detected by reverse transcriptase PCR. *Applied and Environmental Microbiology* 66:3119–24
- 134. Wasmund N, Voss M, Lochte K. 2001. Evidence of nitrogen fixation by non-heterocystous cyanobacteria in the Baltic Sea and re-calculation of a budget of nitrogen fixation. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 214:1–14
- 135. Zehr JP, Waterbury JB, Turner PJ, Montoya JP, Omoregie E, et al. 2001. Unicellular cyanobacteria fix  $N_2$  in the subtropical North Pacific Ocean. *Nature* 412:635–38
- 136. Montoya JP, Carpented EJ, Capone DG. 2002. Nitrogen fixation and nitrogen isotope abundances in zooplankton of the oligotrophic North Atlantic. *Limnology and Oceanography* 47:1617–28
- 137. Pantoja S, Repeta DJ, Sachs JP, Sigman DM. 2002. Stable isotope constraints on the nitrogen cycle of the Mediterranean Sea water column. *Deep Sea Research Part I: Oceanographic Research Papers* 49:1609–21
- 138. Capone DG. 1993. Determination of nitrogenase activity in aquatic samples using the acetylene reduction procedure. In *Handbook of Methods in Aquatic Microbial Ecology*, eds. Kemp PF, Sherr BF, Sherr EB, Cole JJ. Boca Raton, Fla: CRC Press. pp. 621–631 https://doi.org/10.1201/9780203752746-74/10.1201/ 9780203752746-74
- 139. Moisander P, Lehtimäki J, Sivonen K, Kononen K. 1996. Comparison of  $^{15}N_2$  and acetylene reduction methods for the measurement of nitrogen fixation by Baltic Sea cyanobacteria. *Phycologia* 35:140–146
- 140. Kayanne H, Hirota M, Yamamuro M, Koike I. 2005. Nitrogen fixation of filamentous cyanobacteria in a coral reef measured using three different methods. *Coral Reefs* 24:197–200
- 141. Oremland RS, Taylor BF. 1975. Inhibition of methanogenesis in marine sediments by acetylene and ethylene: validity of the acetylene reduction assay for anaerobic microcosms. *Applied Microbiology* 30:707–9
- 142. Montoya JP, Voss M, Kähler P, Capone DG. 1996. A simple, high precision, high-sensitivity tracer assay for N(inf2) fixation. *Applied and Environmental Microbiology* 62:986–93
- 143. Mulholland MR, Bernhardt PW. 2005. The effect of growth rate, phosphorus concentrations and temperature on N<sub>2</sub> fixation, carbon fixation, and nitrogen release in continuous cultures of *Trichodesmium* IMS101. *Limnology and Oceanography* 50:839–49
- 144. Peterson BJ, Fry B. 1987. Stable isotopes in ecosystem studies. Annual Review of Ecology and Systematics 18:293–320
- 145. Robinson D. 2001.  $\delta^{15}$ N as an integrator of the nitrogen cycle. Trends in Ecology & Evolution 16:153–162
- 146. Gu B, Chapman AD, Schelske CL. 2006. Factors controlling seasonal variations in stable isotope composition of particulate organic matter in a softwater eutrophic lake. *Limnology and Oceanography* 51:2837–48
- 147. Patoine A, Graham MD, Leavitt PR. 2006. Spatial variation of nitrogen fixation in lakes of the northern Great Plains. *Limnology and Oceanography* 51:1665–77
- 148. Zehr JP, Jenkins BD, Short SM, Steward GF. 2003. Nitrogenase gene diversity and microbial community structure: a crosssystem comparison. *Environmental Microbiology* 5:539–54
- 149. Short SM, Zehr JP. 2005. Quantitative analysis of nifH genes and transcripts from aquatic environments. *Methods in Enzymology* 397:380–94
- 150. Man-Aharonovich D, Kress N, Zeev EB, Berman-Frank I, Béjà O. 2007. Molecular ecology of nifH genes and transcripts in the eastern Mediterranean Sea. *Environmental Microbiology* 9:2354–63

- 151. Coelho MRR, Marriel IE, Jenkins SN, Lanyon CV, Seldin L, et al. 2009. Molecular detection and quantification of *nifH* gene sequences in the rhizosphere of sorghum (*Sorghum bicolor*). sown with two levels of nitrogen fertilizer. *Applied Soil Ecology* 42:48–53
- 152. Chowdhury SP, Schmid M, Hartmann A, Tripathi AK. 2009. Diversity of 16S-rRNA and *nifH* genes derived from rhizosphere soil and roots of an endemic drought tolerant grass *Lasiurus sindicus*. *European Journal of Soil Biology* 45:114–22
- 153. Gaby JC, Buckley DH. 2011. A global census of nitrogenase diversity. *Environmental Microbiology* 13:1790–99
- 154. Orchard ED, Webb EA, Dyhrman ST. 2009. Molecular analysis of the phosphorus starvation response in *Trichodesmium* spp. *Environmental Microbiology* 11:2400–11
- Berg OG, Kurland CG. 2002. Evolution of microbial genomes: sequence acquisition and loss. *Molecular Biology and Evolution* 19:2265–76
- 156. Short SM, Jenkins BD, Zehr JP. 2004. Spatial and temporal distribution of two diazotrophic bacteria in the Chesapeake Bay. *Applied and Environmental Microbiology* 70:2186–92
- 157. Tilman D, Downing JA. 1994. Biodiversity and stability in grasslands. *Nature* 367:363–65
- 158. Morford SL, Houlton BZ, Houlton BZ, Dahlgren RA. 2011. Increased forest ecosystem carbon and nitrogen storage from nitrogen rich bedrock. *Nature* 477:78–81
- 159. Hungate BA, Dukes JS, Shaw MR, Luo Y, Field CB. 2003. Nitrogen and climate change. *Science* 302:1512–13

- 160. Fowler D, Steadman CE, Stevenson D, Coyle M, Rees RM, et al. 2015. Effects of global change during the 21st century on the nitrogen cycle. *Atmospheric Chemistry and Physics* 15:13849–93
- Vitousek PM, Aber JD, Howarth RW, Likens GE, Matson PA, et al. 1997. Human alteration of the global nitrogen cycle: sources and consequences. *Ecological Applications* 7:737–50
- 162. Galloway JN, Townsend AR, Erisman JW, Bekunda M, Cai Z, et al. 2008. Transformation of the nitrogen cycle: recent trends, questions, and potential solutions. *Science* 320:889–92
- 163. Huenneke LF, Hamburg SP, Koide R, Mooney HA, Vitousek PM. 1990. Effects of soil resources on plant invasion and community structure in Californian serpentine grassland. *Ecology* 71:478–91
- Deslippe JR, Egger KN, Henry GHR. 2005. Impacts of warming and fertilization on nitrogen-fixing microbial communities in the Canadian High Arctic. *FEMS Microbiology Ecology* 53:41–50
- 165. Crews TE, Farrington H, Vitousek PM. 2000. Changes in asymbiotic, heterotrophic nitrogen fixation on leaf litter of *Metrosideros polymorpha* with long-term ecosystem development in Hawaii. *Ecosystems* 3:386–95

Copyright: © 2021 by the author(s). Exclusive Licensee Maximum Academic Press, Fayetteville, GA. This article is an open access article distributed under Creative Commons Attribution License (CC BY 4.0), visit https:// creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/.